Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page1 of 18

Exhibit C

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page2 of 18

MORRISON

October 11, 2010

FOERSTER

425 MARKET STREET SAN FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA 94105-2482

TELEPHONE: 415.268.7000 FACSIMILE: 415.268.7522

WWW.MOFO.COM

MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP NEW YORK, SAN FRANCISCO, LOS ANGELES, PALO ALTO,

SAN DIEGO, WASHINGTON, D.C. NORTHERN VIRGINIA, DENVER,

SACRAMENTO, WALNUT CREEK

TOKYO, LONDON, BEIJING, Shanghai, Hong Kong, Singapore, Brussels

Writer's Direct Contact 415.268.6853 tblakely@mofo.com

By E-Mail

Lily Farel, Esq. United States Department of Justice Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch P.O. Box 883 Washington, D.C. 20044

Re: Vietnam Veterans of America, et. al. v. Central Intelligence Agency, et. al., No. CV 09-00037-CW (N.D. Cal.)

Dear Ms. Farel,

I write in response to your October 8, 2010 letter regarding the protective order to govern discovery. This letter discusses only those items that appear to remain in dispute.

1. Production of Materials Produced by Plaintiff and Non-Parties.

Plaintiffs are disappointed (and, frankly, confused) by Defendants' continued resistance to agreeing to a protective order that will permit *all* parties — not just Defendants — to protect confidential material in discovery. Of course the protective order in this action must be mutual and permit Plaintiffs (and non-parties) to designate appropriate material for protection so as to limit its use to this litigation. Plaintiffs are entitled to seek protection for information that implicates their rights to privacy, including, *inter alia*, personal private information such as health and financial records, and personal identifying information. Non-parties may wish to protect information for these reasons or others, including to safeguard confidential, commercially sensitive, or proprietary business information. Defendants' long-standing resistance to this basic concept is disconcerting.

Defendants object to the phrase "any other information protected by constitutional or statutory rights to privacy." To end this dispute, Plaintiffs propose adopting language from Section 1 of the Northern District of California Model Protective Order ("Model Order"). Accordingly, Plaintiffs have revised the operative language of Section 3(iv) to read:

"any other confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than

sf-2906108

MORRISON FOERSTER

Lily Farel, Esq. October 11, 2010 Page Two

prosecuting this litigation may be warranted, including but not limited to information protected from disclosure under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act ("HIPAA"), 42 U.S.C. § 201, and information protected by 38 U.S.C. § 5701."

2. Designation of Pretrial Testimony.

Plaintiffs agree to remove from Section 4.3(b) the sentence: "As set forth in Paragraph 2.2, this Protective Order specifically excludes any material or testimony to be produced or used during trial and a separate order will govern trial testimony."

Plaintiffs do not agree to remove the requirement that materials disclosed in testimony during depositions or other pretrial proceedings be designated for protection within 30 days. In order for the parties to comply with the protective order, *they must have notice about what material is covered*. The provision as drafted provides an adequate timeframe for the parties to review and designate testimony as appropriate. By comparison, the Model Order states that "the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing or other proceeding, all protected testimony." A party requiring more than 30 days to review and designate deposition testimony is free to move for additional time.

3. Encryption and Location Requirements.

As discussed on September 23, and outlined in my September 30 letter, Plaintiffs do not agree with the burdensome encryption and location restrictions proposed by Defendants. Plaintiffs appreciate that the Veterans Administration is obligated to protect confidential materials, and has instituted internal procedures to carry out their obligations. We believe the provision of the Model Order incorporated into Plaintiffs' revised proposed protective order provides adequate protection for materials produced by the VA while in Plaintiffs' possession. We also note that other protective orders in cases involving the VA as a party have not included the burdensome encryption and location requirements that the VA is insisting on here.

4. Proposed Additions to Section 12.

Plaintiffs do not agree to Defendants' proposed Sections 12.5 and 12.6. These sections do not provide clarification for the use and protection of the information as stated in your letter. Section 12.5 is unnecessary, and discusses the "discoverability, relevance, or admissibility of any record." Section 12.6 also is unnecessary, and appears to reinforce Defendants' plan to continue to resist disclosure. These are simply not appropriate topics for a protective order.

MORRISON FOERSTER

Lily Farel, Esq. October 11, 2010 Page Three

5. Designation of Protected Materials.

Plaintiffs see no reason to introduce unusual terminology into this protective order. The Model Order — like virtually every protective order entered by state or federal courts — uses the term "Confidential" to identify protected materials. Non-parties will expect to take advantage of a "Confidential" designation for confidential or proprietary material. Federal government agencies are parties to many suits governed by protective orders using the term "Confidential" to identify material subject to protection, including suits in this district — Executive Order 13526 notwithstanding. Finally, the protective order contemplates that material will be designated as "CONFIDENTIAL — PRODUCED SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER." It is hard to see how this designation, which specifically references the protective order, will confuse recipients into believing that "confidential" actually refers to something else. Accordingly, we do not believe that the use of the term "Confidential" in the Protective Order as drafted will be a source of confusion in this case.

* * *

I enclose a revised proposed protective order, redlined to show changes from Plaintiffs' original proposed protective order and the version I sent you last week, to reflect Plaintiffs' further efforts to resolve the parties' disputes. Given the Wednesday deadline for Plaintiffs' reply brief, Plaintiffs must ask for Defendants' response to this letter and draft order by the end of the business day tomorrow. I also am available any time tomorrow afternoon (Pacific Time) if you would like to talk live to discuss these issues. If we are able to agree to the enclosed proposed protective order tomorrow, Plaintiffs will prepare a stipulation and request that this motion be removed from the Court's calendar. Otherwise, Plaintiffs will submit their reply brief on Wednesday and request that the Court resolve all remaining disputes.

Very truly yours. Timothy W. Blakely

Enclosure

cc: Caroline Lewis Wolverton, Esq. Brigham J. Bowen, Esq Kimberly L. Herb, Esq. Gordon P. Erspamer, Esq.

	Case4:09-cv-00037-CW D	ocument164-3	Filed10/13/10	Page5 of 18
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9	UNITED STATE	ES DISTRICT COURT	ſ	
10	NORTHERN DIST	RICT OF CALIFORN	IIA	
11	OAKLAN	ND DIVISION		
12			00 0027 CW	
13	VIETNAM VETERANS OF AMERICA, a No Profit Corporation; SWORDS TO	on- Case No. CV	09-003/-CW	
14	PLOWSHARES: VETERANS RIGHTS ORGANIZATION, a California Non-Profit	[PROPOSEI	D] PROTECTIVE O	RDER
15	Corporation; BRUCE PRICE; FRANKLIN D. ROCHELLE; LARRY MEIROW; ERIC P.		G DISCOVERY	
16	MUTH; DAVID C. DUFRANE; and WRAY C FORREST, individually, on behalf of themselv	ves		
17	and all others similarly situated,			
18	Plaintiffs,			
19	V.			
20	CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY; LEC PANETTA, Director of the Central Intelligence	e		
21	Agency; UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT (DEFENSE; DR. ROBERT M. GATES, Secreta	ary		
22	of Defense; UNITED STATES DEPARTMEN OF THE ARMY; PETE GEREN, United State	es		
23	Secretary of the Army; UNITED STATES OF AMERICA; and ERIC H. HOLDER, JR.,			
24	Attorney General of the United States,			
25	Defendants.			
26				
27		1		
28				Delete
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>sf- 2902685</u>			/ Deretet

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page6 of 18

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

1

2	Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production, by parties	•-
3	and non-parties, of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection	
4	from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation would	
5	be warranted. In particular (but without limitation), this action is likely to involve production of	
6	information that is protected by the Privacy Act of 1974, 5 U.S.C. § 552a ("Privacy Act"), 38	
7	U.S.C. § 5701 ("Veterans Claims") and or Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act,	. /
8	42 U.S.C. § 201 ("HIPAA"). Although Plaintiffs are not technically bound by the Privacy Act	
9	respecting their production of documents or filings, Plaintiffs endeavor to protect private and	
10	medical information related to the right of privacy concerning individual veterans that is likely to	
11	be produced during discovery or submitted to the Court, including but not limited to medical	
12	records or benefits claims files related to the Individual Plaintiffs and putative class members.	
13	Pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552a(b)(11), which permits disclosure of Privacy Act records by court	
14	order, 45 C.F.R. § 164.512(e)(1)(i), which permits disclosure of protected health information by	
15	court order, <u>38 U.S.C. § 5701(b)(2)</u> , which permits disclosure of files, records, reports, and other	
16	papers and documents pertaining to a claim for veterans benefits when required by court order,	
17	and Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, which authorizes entry of an appropriate	
18	protective order, the Court hereby enters the following Protective Order Governing Discovery	
19	("Protective Order").	
20	This action is also likely to involve documents the United States withholds from	
21	distribution outside of the Federal Government. The United States may designate certain	
22	documents as "Protected Material" under this protective order to prevent public disclosure of	
23	covered documents.	
24	Defendants are authorized to release to Plaintiffs, their counsel, the Court in this case, and	
25	other parties identified in Section 7.1 below, government records containing Privacy Act,	
26	Veterans Claims, or HIPAA protected information without obtaining prior written consent of the	
27	individuals to whom the records pertain.	
28		
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW sf- 2902685	

Formatted: Indent: First line: 0.5", No bullets or numbering

Deleted: ("HIPAA")

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page7 of 18

1	This Protective Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses					
2	to discovery and the protection it affords extends only to the limited information or items that are					
3	entitled under the applicable legal principles to treatment as confidential. As set forth in Section					
4	10, below, this Protective Order creates no entitlement to file confidential information under seal;					
5	Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and reflects the standards					
6	that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.					
7	2. DEFINITIONS					
8	2.1 <u>Party:</u> any party to this action, including all of its representatives, agents, and any					
9	present or former officers, directors, employees, investigators, consultants, retained Experts, and					
10	Outside Counsel (and their support staffs).					
11	2.2 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material:</u> all items or information, regardless of the					
12	medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,					
13	declarations, transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced or generated in disclosures or					
14	responses to pre-trial discovery or other pre-trial proceedings in this matter. This Protective					
15	Order specifically excludes the production or use of material or testimony during trial.	1	De tria coi			
16	2.3 <u>Receiving Party:</u> a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a	1	pro of			
17	Producing Party.					
18	2.4 <u>Producing Party:</u> a Party or non-party that produces Disclosure or Discovery					
19	Material in this action.					
20	2.5 <u>Designating Party:</u> a Party or non-party that designates information or items that it					
21	produces or includes in disclosures, responses to discovery requests, affidavits, declarations, or					
22	exhibits submitted to the Court as subject to the terms of the Protective Order.		De			
23	2.6 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as	1 6	Co De			
24	"Confidential - Subject to Protective Order" as described in paragraph 4, below.	1 17	De De			
25	2.6 <u>Counsel:</u> attorneys who are <u>employees of a Party (as well as their support staffs)</u>	11	att in			
26	and attorneys who are not employees of a Party but who represent or advise a Party in this action	/ 1	sha De atte			
27	(as well as their support staffs).		in sha			
28		⊢	Pla De			
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>\$f- 2902685</u>					

Deleted: At least sixty days prior to the trial date, the parties shall meet and confer and submit any separate proposed protective order governing the treatment of confidential information during trial.

Deleted: all Covered Documents and Covered Information as defined

Deleted: 3

Deleted: Outside

Deleted: The Department of Justice attorneys designated as counsel of record in this action (and their support staff) shall be considered Outside Counsel for Defendants. The Morrison & Foerster attorneys designated as counsel of record in this action (and their support staff) shall be considered Outside Counsel for Plaintiffs.

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Pageß of 18

1	2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to		leted: <#> <u>House Counsel:</u> attorneys o are employees of a Party (as well as
2	the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its Counsel or assigned by the Defendants to	thei	ir support staffs).¶ > <u>Counsel (without qualifier):</u> Outside
3	serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action and who is not a past or a current		unsel and House Counsel (as well as ir support staffs).¶
4	employee of a Party or of a competitor of a Party and who, at the time of retention, is not	For	rmatted: Bullets and Numbering
5	anticipated to become an employee of a Party or a competitor of a Party. This definition includes		
6	a professional jury or trial consultant retained in connection with this litigation.		
7	2.8 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services		
8	(e.g., photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or demonstrations; organizing,		
9	storing, retrieving data in any form or medium; etc.) and their employees and subcontractors.		
10	3. DOCUMENTS AND INFORMATION COVERED BY THIS ORDER		
11	(a) Except as provided in paragraph 12.3, this Protective Order shall govern		
12	the use and disclosure of any document or information in connection with this action that		
13	constitutes or reflects information derived from:		
14	(i) a record subject to the requirements of the Privacy Act;		
15	(ii) a medical record or other document containing information that		
16	relates to the right of privacy and/or past, present or future physical or mental health or condition		
17	("Health Information") of any person other than information specifically made public in the		
18	Complaint in this action;		
19	(iii) references to personal information such as Social Security		
20	Numbers ("SSN"), Dates of Birth ("DOB"), telephone numbers, and financial account numbers;		
21	(iv) any other <u>confidential</u> , proprietary, or private information for	con	leted: information protected by istitutional or statutory rights to vacy
22	which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than	priv	J
23	prosecuting this litigation may be warranted, including but not limited to information protected		
24	from disclosure under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act ("HIPAA"), 42		
25	U.S.C. § 201, and information protected by 38 U.S. C. § 5701;		
26	۰	doc	leted: classified information and cuments maintained by Defendants or er government entities;
27	(v) <u>information maintained by Defendants or other government</u>		rmatted: Bullets and Numbering
28	entities not otherwise publicly available, or		leted: or leted: sf-2851780
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>\$f- 2902685</u>		

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Pagep of 18

1	(vi) any other information (regardless of how generated, stored or	
2	maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under standards developed under	
3	Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.	
4	(b) Documents that are reasonably determined to be within the scope of	
5	paragraph 3(a) by a Producing Party are hereinafter referred to as "Covered Documents."	
6	Covered Documents shall be marked by the Producing Party in accordance with paragraph 4,	
7	below.	
8	(c) Except as specified <u>in paragraph 3(d)</u> below, all information derived from	
9	Covered Documents, even if incorporated in another document or compilation or referred to in	
10	pre-trial testimony, shall be treated as "Covered Information." Covered Information shall be	Delete
11	subject to the requirements of this Protective Order.	Delete docume testimor
12	(d) Document summaries, statistical compilations, or other summaries of	from a 0 marked
13	materials identified in paragraphs 3(a)(i), (ii), and (iv), however, that do not contain information	Forma
14	by which specific individuals, including Plaintiffs, can be identified (e.g., by name, social security	Privacy
15	number, symbol, description or other form of personal identification) are not covered by this	
16	Protective Order.	
17	4. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL	
18	4.1 <u>Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection</u> . Each Party	
19	or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this Protective Order must	
20	take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate	
21	standards. Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are	
22	shown to be clearly unjustified, or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to	
23	unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process, or to impose unnecessary	
24	expenses and burdens on other parties), expose the Designating Party to sanctions.	
25	4.2 If it comes to a Party's or non-party's attention that information or items are not	
26	designated for protection that should qualify for protection, that Party or non-party shall as soon	
27	as practicable notify the Producing Party in writing. The Producing Party shall be required to	
28	redesignate that information in accordance with paragraph 4.3 and reproduce the contested	Delete
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. 4 CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>\$f- 2902685</u>	

Deleted: continue to

Deleted: regardless of whether the document, compilation or pre-trial testimony containing information derived from a Covered Document has been marked in accordance with paragraph 4.

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Deleted: information covered by the Privacy Act

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page10 of 18

1	information or items at its own expense. Should the Producing Party disagree with the notifying	
2	Party or non-party regarding the propriety of the redesignation, the parties shall follow the	
3	procedures set forth in Paragraph 5 of this Protective Order. If it comes to a Party's or a non-	
4	party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for	
5	protection, that Party or non-party must promptly notify all other parties that it is withdrawing the	
6	mistaken designation.	
7	4.3 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u> . Except as otherwise provided in this	
8	Protective Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 4.3(a), below), or as otherwise stipulated	
9	or ordered, material that qualifies for protection under this Protective Order must be clearly so	
10	designated before the material is disclosed or produced.	
11	Designation in conformity with this Protective Order requires:	
12	(a) <u>for information in documentary form</u> (apart from transcripts of depositions	
13	or other pretrial proceedings), that the Producing Party mark the document as	
14	"CONFIDENTIAL — PRODUCED SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER," or with a similar	
15	marking in a way that brings its attention to a reasonable examiner.	
16	A Party or non-party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection	
17	need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which	
18	material it would like copied and produced. After the inspecting Party has identified the	
19	documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents	
20	qualify for protection under this Order, then, before producing the specified documents, the	
21	Producing Party must mark those documents as "CONFIDENTIAL — PRODUCED SUBJECT	
22	TO PROTECTIVE ORDER," or with a similar marking in a way that brings its attention to a	
23	reasonable examiner.	
24	(b) <u>for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings</u> , that the	
25	Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the testimony identify on the record, before the close of	
26	the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony, and further specify any	
27	portions of the testimony that qualify for protection under paragraph 3(a) of this Protective Order.	
28	When it is impractical to identify separately each portion of testimony that is entitled to	
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>\$f- 2902685</u>	

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page11 of 18

protection, and when it appears that substantial portions of the testimony may qualify for
protection, the Party or non-party that sponsors, offers, or gives the testimony may invoke on the
record (before the deposition or proceeding is concluded) a right to have up to 30 days from
receipt of the deposition or hearing transcript to identify the specific portions of the testimony as
to which protection is sought. Only those portions of the testimony that are appropriately
designated for protection within the 30 days shall be covered by the provisions of this Protective
Order.

8 Transcript pages containing Protected Material must be separately bound by the court
9 reporter, who must affix to the bottom of each such page the legend "CONFIDENTIAL –
10 SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER," or with a similar marking in a way that brings its
11 attention to a reasonable examiner, as instructed by the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring
12 the witness or presenting the testimony.

(c) for any Covered Document whose medium makes marking the Covered
 Document impractical, such as computer data, that the Producing Party mark the diskette case and
 any accompanying paper or e-mail cover letter "CONFIDENTIAL — PRODUCED SUBJECT
 TO PROTECTIVE ORDER," or with a similar marking in a way that brings its attention to a
 reasonable examiner. Designation and marking of Covered Documents in accordance with this
 paragraph shall be deemed effective to bring information contained in such documents under the
 protection of this Protective Order unless and until the Court orders otherwise.

(d) <u>for information produced in some form other than documentary, and for</u>
 <u>other tangible items</u>, that the Producing Party mark the exterior of the container(s) in which the
 information or item is stored with the legend "CONFIDENTIAL — PRODUCED SUBJECT TO
 PROTECTIVE ORDER," or with a similar marking in a way that brings its attention to a
 reasonable examiner.
 CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

26 5.1 <u>Available Challenges</u>. The Receiving Party may challenge the Producing Party's
 27 designation of material for protection or the Producing Party's failure to designate material for
 28 protection under this Protective Order.
 [PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC.

CASE No. CV 09-0037-CW sf- 2902685 **Deleted:** As set forth in Paragraph 2.2, this Protective Order specifically excludes any material or testimony to be produced or used during trial and a separate order will govern trial testimony.

Deleted: sf-2851780

6

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page12 of 18

1 5.2 Timing of Challenges. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's 2 confidentiality designation, or to the Producing Party's failure to designate material for protection 3 under this Protective Order, is necessary to avoid foreseeable substantial unfairness, unnecessary 4 economic burdens, or a later significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not 5 waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation, or failure to designate, by electing not to 6 mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is made.

7 5.3 Meet and Confer. A Party that elects to initiate a challenge to a Designating 8 Party's confidentiality designation or lack thereof must do so in good faith and must begin the 9 process by conferring with Counsel for the Designating Party. In conferring, the challenging 10 Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation or lack thereof was 11 not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, 12 to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis 13 for the chosen designation or lack thereof. A challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of 14 the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first.

15 5.4 Judicial Intervention. A Party that elects to press a challenge to a confidentiality 16 designation or lack thereof after considering the justification offered by the Designating Party 17 may file and serve a motion under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 18 79-5, if applicable) that identifies the challenged material and sets forth in detail the basis for the 19 challenge. Any such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration that affirms that 20 the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding 21 paragraph and that sets forth with specificity the justification for the confidentiality designation 22 that was given by the Designating Party in the meet and confer dialogue. The burden of 23 persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Party advocating the inclusion of a 24 confidentiality designation on Disclosure or Discovery Material. Until the Court rules on the 25 Party's challenge, all parties shall provisionally treat the challenged material as subject to the 26 protections of this Protective Order. 27

- 6. DURATION
- 28

[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW 2902685

Deleted: sf-2851780

7

Deleted: counsel

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page13 of 18

1	Even after the termination of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this	
2	Protective Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a	
3	court order otherwise directs.	
4	7. DISCLOSURE AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL	
5	7.1 <u>Disclosure of Protected Material</u> . Except upon the prior written consent of the	Deleted: Defendants are authorized to release records protected under the
6	Producing Party originally designating Protected Material as containing information within the	Privacy Act, without obtaining prior written consent of the individuals to whom the records pertain, to the persons
7	scope of paragraph 3(a) of this Order, or as otherwise expressly provided in this Order, a	identified in subparagraphs (a)-(h), below.
8	Receiving Party may disclose Protected Material it receives from a Producing Party only to:	Deleted: may be disclosed
9	(a) Counsel in this action, as well as employees or consultants of Counsel to	Deleted: said
10	whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation and who have	
11	signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);	
12	(b) Certain designated representatives of Plaintiffs and Defendants (two	
13	representatives from each Defendant agency or Plaintiff non-profit corporation and three	
14	representatives of the Individual Plaintiffs) who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by	
15	Protective Order" (Exhibit A);	
16	(c) Experts (as defined in this Protective Order) to whom disclosure is	
17	reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by	
18	Protective Order" (Exhibit A);	
19	(d) the Court and its personnel;	
20	(e) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom disclosure is	
21	reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by	
22	Protective Order" (Exhibit A);	
23	(f) <u>fact witnesses in the action (and their counsel)</u> during depositions or in	
24	preparation of affidavits or declarations for pretrial testimony, to whom disclosure is reasonably	Deleted: fact witnesses in the action (and their counsel) to
25	necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective	
26	Order" (Exhibit A). As set forth in paragraph 4.3(b), pages of transcribed deposition testimony or	
27	exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court	
28	reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Protective Order;	Deleted: sf-2851780
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. 8 CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>\$f- 2902685</u>	

	Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page1	4 of 18
1	(g) the author or listed recipient of the document or the original source of the	
2	Protected Material; and	
3	(h) the person to whom the Protected Material pertains.	
4	7.2 <u>Use of Protected Material.</u> Except as provided in paragraph 12.3, unless otherwise	
5	ordered by a court or otherwise provided in this Order, Protected Material received by a Party	
6	during the course of this litigation may be used only in connection with the prosecution or	
7	defense of this litigation and for no other purpose and shall be marked by the Producing Party as	
8	"CONFIDENTIAL — PRODUCED SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER," or with a similar	
9	marking in a way that brings its attention to a reasonable examiner.	
10	7.3 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a	
11	location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under	
12	this Order.	
13	8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER	
14	LITIGATION	
15	If a Receiving Party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation that	
16	would compel disclosure of Protected Material, the Receiving Party must so notify the	
17	Designating Party, in writing (by electronic mail, if possible) immediately, and in no event more	
18	than what is reasonable with the exercise of due diligence, after receiving the subpoena or order.	
19	Such notification must include a copy of the subpoena or court order. The Receiving Party also	
20	must immediately inform in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the	
21	other litigation that some or all the material covered by the subpoena or order is the subject of this	
22	Protective Order. In addition, the Receiving Party must deliver a copy of this Protective Order	
23	promptly to the party in the other action that caused the subpoena or order to issue. The purpose	
24	of imposing these duties is to alert the interested parties to the existence of this Protective Order	
25	and to afford the Designating Party in this case an opportunity to try to protect its confidentiality	
26	interests in the court from which the subpoena or order issued. The Designating Party shall bear	
27	the burdens and the expenses of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and	
28	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW 9	Delete

[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE OR CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>sf- 2902685</u> GOVERNING DISC.

l.

ed: sf-2851780

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page15 of 18

nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party
 in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

3

9.

UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

4 Except as provided in paragraph 12.3, if a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or 5 otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized 6 under this Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the 7 Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosure(s), (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all copies of 8 the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosure(s) were 9 made of all the terms of this Protective Order, if they are not already so informed, and (d) request 10 such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" attached 11 hereto as Exhibit A, if they have not already done so. Failure to designate any materials as 12 subject to the terms of this Protective Order shall not constitute a waiver of any subsequent 13 assertion that the materials are covered by this Protective Order. Unauthorized disclosure for an 14 improper purpose may subject the disclosing party to sanctions. 15 10. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL 16 Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured after 17 appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action 18 any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply 19 with Civil Local Rule 79-5. 20 FINAL DISPOSITION 11. 21 Except as otherwise required by statute, including the Federal Records Act, 44 U.S.C. § 22 3010, et seq., or regulation, within ninety (90) days after the final termination of this action, each 23 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party, unless otherwise 24 ordered or agreed in writing by the Producing Party. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected 25 Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other form of

26 reproducing or capturing any of the Covered Documents or Covered Information. With

27 permission in writing from the Designating Party, the Receiving Party may destroy some or all of

28 the Protected Material instead of returning it. Whether the Protected Material is returned or [PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW sf- 2902685

Deleted: sf-2851780

10

Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page16 of 18

1	destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if				
2	not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the ninety (90) day deadline that				
3	identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or				
4	destroyed and that affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,				
5	compilations, summaries or other forms of reproducing or capturing any of the Covered				
6	Documents and Covered Information. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to				
7	retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, transcripts, legal memoranda,				
8	correspondence or attorney work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any				
9	such archival copies that contain or constitute Protective Material remain subject to this				
10	Protective Order as set forth in Section 6 (DURATION), above.				
11	12. MISCELLANEOUS				
12	12.1 <u>Right to Further Relief.</u> Nothing in this Protective Order abridges the right of any				
13	person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.				
14	12.2 <u>Right to Assert Other Objections.</u> No Party waives any right it otherwise would				
15	have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in				
16	this Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to the use in				
17	evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.				
18	12.3 <u>No Effect on Existing Rights.</u> The status of a document or information as				
19	Protected Material in this litigation shall not prevent disclosure or use as permitted by law or				
20	compelled by order of any court, or restrict a party's use outside of this litigation of materials				
21	produced by that Party. This Protective Order does not restrict individual Plaintiffs' use of				
22	Privacy-Act, 38 U.S.C. § 5701, or HIPAA protected records pertaining to them. Nothing in this				
23	Protective Order shall be construed to confer rights on any third party, except to the extent that a				
24	third party produces documents or other information in this action subject to the terms of this				
25	Protective Order.				
26					
27	IT IS SO ORDERED.				
28					
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>\$f- 2902685</u>				

	Case4:09-cv-00037-CW	Document164-3	Filed10/13/10	Page1	7 of 18
1	DATED: August, 2010				
2	, , , ,	JAMES LARSON UNITED STATES M			
3					
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					Deleted: sf-2851780
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>\$f- 2902685</u>	2.		12	

	Case4:09-cv-00037-CW Document164-3 Filed10/13/10 Page18	of 18
1	EXHIBIT A	
2	ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND	
3	I, [print or type full name], of	
4	[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and	
5	understand the Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the	
6	Northern District of California on [date] in the case of Vietnam Veterans of America, et al., v.	
7	<i>Central Intelligence Agency, et al.</i> , Case No. CV 09-0037-CW. I agree to comply with and to be	
8	bound by all the terms of this Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to	
9	so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly	
10	promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this	
11	Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this	
12	Protective Order.	
13	I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the	
14	Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Protective Order,	
15	even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint	
16	[print or type full name] of	
17	[print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in	
18	connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Protective Order.	
19		
20		
21	Date:	
22	City and State where sworn and signed:	
23	Printed name:	
24	-	
25	Signature:	
26		
27		
28		Deleted
	[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER GOVERNING DISC. CASE NO. CV 09-0037-CW <u>sf- 2902685</u>	